

---

## Meeting of Executive Members for City Strategy and Advisory Panel

16 March 2009

Report of the Director of City Strategy

### HAXBY RAIL STATION UPDATE IV

#### Summary

1. This report updates Members with progress on developing a new rail station at Haxby. The report summarises progress on the scheme to date and seeks approval to consider the funding of the development of the scheme from the Council's 2009/10 LTP capital programme to enable a Major Scheme Business Case to be prepared.

#### Background

2. City of York Council has included an initiative to provide a new rail station at Haxby in both the Local Transport Plan (2001/02 – 2005/06) and its second Local Transport Plan (2006/2007 – 2010/2011).
3. This report has been prepared to update Members following continued delays in developing a new rail station at Haxby. This report is the fourth update, detailing progress on the scheme. Subsequent reports will be provided either at the request of Members or when sufficient further progress has been made.
4. It was agreed by the Executive Member for Planning and Transport on 3 September 2003 that a bid to build new railway stations at Haxby and Strensall would be submitted in two phases as follows:-

##### ***Phase I***

*Bid for the construction of Haxby station. This would utilise the existing TransPennine Express service.*

##### ***Phase II***

*Bid for the construction of Strensall station and provision of revenue support to operate a new shuttle service. There would also be the potential to include York Hospital Station within this bid, should a suitable transport, economic and social case be made.*

5. It was agreed by Members that this phased approach would provide the following benefits:-

- Immediate progression of a scheme following a decision by Network Rail and approval through the Regional Funding Allocation.
- Improved business case (transport, economic and social benefits). This would increase the chance of our bid for Regional Funding Allocation money being successful and securing Network Rail's and First TransPennine's continuing commitment.
- Direct trains from Haxby to Scarborough, York, Leeds, Huddersfield, Manchester Piccadilly and Liverpool. Good connections at Manchester to Manchester Airport and some direct trains. Direct trains to Warrington, offering connections with West Coast mainline services;
- No immediate need to upgrade Scarborough Bridge or Bootham Crossing as part of scheme;
- Potential for public / private funding with an external agency.

## **Update Phase I**

6. Punctuality and performance of services on the rail network is paramount. In order for Network Rail to provide 'scheme sign-off' for a new station at Haxby, it is critical that the Council and First TransPennine (FTPE), being the relevant Train Operating Company (TOC), can demonstrate that services making an additional stop at Haxby will not detract from the reliability of the existing services and other rail services that interact at various points across the rail network. Some detailed modelling work has been carried out to assess the impact of additional stops at Haxby on the wider network and FTPE has undertaken a review of maximum line speeds between Scarborough and York following the introduction of new rolling stock and renewal of track over recent years. However, even though these have been carried out, Network Rail has advised that more track renewals and additional canting and tamping works will be required to improve the linespeed further. The expectation is that completion of these works will maintain service reliability, but further modelling, to confirm this or otherwise, will need to be undertaken by Network Rail as part of the detailed design process.
7. Since the submission of the Major Scheme Business case in 2005, Network Rail has taken on the role of the third party funder for the project from Laing Rail Projects. Detailed negotiation has been ongoing with Network Rail for over two years to progress the construction of the station at Haxby, culminating in the commission of a Network Rail 'Fast Track' project, in October 2008. The Fast Track project, funded by City of York Council, brought together all the key personnel within Network Rail's design and operations teams, representatives from FTPE and Council officers. Its purpose was to determine the feasibility of, and the scope of the investment needed to construct, a station at Haxby, in accordance with Network Rail's Guide to Railway Investment Projects (GRIP), as described in Table 1, to reach GRIP 3 – option selection. GRIP 3 stage, works-up scheme options to a greater degree of certainty, in terms of the design and costs, than previous

stages in the GRIP process. However, the cost estimates still include relatively high allowances for risk and contingencies.

Table 1. Guide to Railway Investment Projects - stages of project development	
GRIP Stage	Description
1	Output definition
2	Pre-feasibility
3	Option selection
4	Single option selection
5	Detailed design
6	Construction test and commission
7	Scheme hand back
8	Project close out

8. The Fast Track Project was completed in December 2008. It presented two options for further consideration:
- Option 1 – Construct station adjacent to the level crossing on Towthorpe Road/Station Road
  - Option 2 – Construct station approximately 250m south of the level crossing on Towthorpe Road/Station Road

Both options are for a 'Category E' station defined as a 'Small staffed station, which will only have one member of staff in attendance and may be staffed for only part of the day'. In addition, both options will require the acquisition, either in part or in full (and alternate provision), of the adjacent allotments to varying degrees.

### **Option Appraisal (from Fast Track)**

#### Option 1

9. Option 1 consists of a staggered platform layout (as shown in Annex A), with the 'Down' (to Scarborough) platform to the north of the level crossing on Towthorpe Road/Station Road, and the 'Up' (to York) platform to the south of the crossing. This arrangement is similar to that of the previous station, which closed in 1930.
10. The location of the platforms either side of the level crossing on Towthorpe Road/Station Road provides convenient access off one of the main routes into Haxby. However, because of its proximity to the crossing, it presents some major safety issues, as there would be a high risk of people crossing either the tracks or Towthorpe Road/Station Road, with disregard of the dangers in doing so, in their urgency for catching a train. This has required the inclusion of a footbridge over the tracks and one over Towthorpe Road/Station Road (both with ramps) to minimise this risk and satisfy the likely requirements of HM Railway Inspectorate (HMRI).
11. The inclusion of the footbridges and the associated ramps will require a significant amount of land acquisition or easements (affecting in the order of

18 properties) for the construction of the station and may also lead to other compensation claims. In addition, the footbridges and ramp are likely to have visual impact, as well as entailing a relatively long route for disabled people from a disabled parking bay to the platform(s). These issues are likely to lead to a local public Inquiry being required as part of the Planning Permission process and it is not clear, at the present time, whether the strength of these issues would be sufficient to lead to planning permission not being granted.

12. Operationally, Option 1 will increase the downtime for the level crossing at Towthorpe Road/Station Road by 12 seconds (maximum). The downtime for the level crossing on York road will, without any signalling alterations, increase by a minute and a half, which may cause additional backing-up of road traffic towards the A1237/York Road junction.

## Option 2

13. The arrangement for Option 2 is for a conventional (opposing platform) layout, approximately 230m south of the Towthorpe Road/Station Road level crossing (as shown in Annex B).
14. As the station in Option 2 is some distance from the level crossing at Towthorpe Road/Station Road, its location is less convenient than Option 1. There are, however, fewer safety issues, resulting in only a single footbridge over the tracks being required. This arrangement requires minimal land acquisition, except for, perhaps, the need for more allotment land to be acquired to accommodate the 90-space (approximate) car park. Furthermore, the layout allows for the future provision of an additional access off Calf Close, should this prove necessary.
15. It is anticipated at the present time, albeit subject to confirmation, that the proposed station works will lie within the 'limits of deviation', and thereby will fall under the provisions of 'permitted development'. However, irrespective of this, other work associated with the station, such as the car park and access roads, will require planning permission.
16. Operationally, Option 2 will increase the downtime for the level crossing at Towthorpe Road/Station Road by 1 minute and 16 seconds, for 'Down' running trains. However, altering the signalling systems may reduce this additional downtime. Similar to Option 1, the downtime for the level crossing on York road will, without any signalling alterations, increase by a minute and a half, for 'Up' trains. This may cause additional backing-up of road traffic towards the A1237/York Road junction, although further investigations may determine whether the downtime can be reduced.

## **Estimates**

17. Option 1
  - £5,966,000 including risk and contingencies but excluding car park, land and £1.2million for tamping and canting works.

18. Option 2

- £4,945,000 including risk and contingencies but excluding car park, land and £1.2million for tamping and canting works. There are still opportunities for reducing costs, for example by utilising passenger lifts instead of ramps to get access to platforms, but this will need agreement with the train operating company.

19. To enable Haxby Station to progress, Network Rail could bring forward the timing of £1.5 million of planned track renewal work to fit with the scheme programme.

### **Network Rail**

20. Following completion of the Fast Track process, Network Rail has indicated its continuing support for the project through part-funding both construction and development costs.

### **Train operating company**

21. FTPE is still supportive of the scheme, provided the business case remained strong.

22. Following this continued support in principle, FTPE participated in the Fast Track process. Its franchise is due to end on 31 January 2012 but there is an option for the Office of Rail Regulation to extend this. However, Network Rail would recoup its costs in constructing Haxby Station through annualised station access charges to the train operating company and these would continue to apply to the next franchise holder.

### **Regional Funding Allocation**

23. Haxby Station was included in the Regional Transport Board's original Regional Funding Advice (RFA1) to the DfT.

24. Following recent re-assessment by consultants working on behalf of the Yorkshire and Humber Assembly and a peer review, Haxby Station has remained in the latest Regional Funding Advice (RFA2) to the DfT, which was issued at the end of February 2009.

### **Timescales**

25. The Option Selection Report, the outcome of the Fast Track process produced for Network Rail, contains an outline programme to progress Option 2 to completion. Key milestones from this programme are included in Table 2 but these assumed an immediate start for the development work and did not take account of approval processes within Network Rail, the DfT and City of York Council, which will delay the start of this process.

Table 2. Key milestones for the development of Option 2.		
Equivalent Network Rail GRIP Stage	Activity	Date for completion
4	Detailed design work following single option selection	July 2009
5	Planning application submitted	September 2009
	Planning application granted	February 2010
6	Start on site	June 2010
7	Scheme hand back	December 2010
8	Project close out	January 2011

26. The majority of funding for the scheme is being sought from the DfT. As such, in addition to the outline GRIP programme, a separate but parallel DfT approvals process has to be followed. The key milestones in this process are shown in Table 3. At present, the timescale for achieving DfT approvals is longer than the GRIP programme, resulting in the projected completion date of early 2013. However, Members should note that this might be shortened by changes in the allocation of funding from the DfT and other value engineering work discussed elsewhere in this Update.

Table 3. Key milestones in the DfT Approvals process	
Milestone	Anticipated accomplishment date
Network Rail GRIP 4 approvals (including confirmation of third party funding)	February 2010
Programme Entry status granted by the DfT	September 2010
Planning Application Submitted (for works other than 'permitted development')	March 2011
Planning Consent granted	July 2011
Contractor appointed	March 2012
Completion/opening	January 2013

## Update Phase II

27. Members have previously asked officers to look at the outline feasibility of pursuing elements of this phase as an alternative to a new station using existing rail services on the line. Given the recent progression of the Haxby Station project and the support from Network Rail and First TransPennine Express (the current franchise holder) and the project's inclusion in the Regional Funding Advice given to the Department for Transport, it would not be appropriate to engage in external discussions on Phase II at this stage. Indeed an additional slow service on the same lines may jeopardise the chances of accommodating a station stop at Haxby within the existing timetable and have further, more complicated implications for services running on the East Coast mainline. A commentary on the use of light rail on the York-Scarborough line is included in Annex C.

## Consultation

28. This report has been produced to update Members on scheme progress. No consultation has been required, or undertaken as part of this report.

## Options

29. This report has been prepared to update Members on scheme progress.
30. The Executive Member is asked to consider the release of capital funding for the next phase of development work for Option 2 of the scheme when the 09/10 City Strategy Capital Programme is presented at the 31 March Executive. The development work would include the preparation of a scheme to Network Rail's GRIP Stage 4 and to refresh the Major Scheme Bid Business Case to allow submission for Programme Entry to the DfT. A further report would be brought forward to Members prior to submission of the business case to the DfT.

## Analysis

31. This report has been prepared to update Members on scheme progress. Owing to the reduced costs, better operational fit and lower environmental impact, it is recommended to progress option 2 through the Network Rail processes.

## Corporate Priorities

32. The scheme would contribute to the following Corporate Aims:

**Corporate Aim 1:** Take Pride in the City, by improving quality and sustainability, creating a clean and safe environment.

The scheme would encourage users to travel using a more sustainable form of transport rather than driving into and around the city.

**Corporate Aim 4:** Create a safe city through transparent partnership working with other agencies and the local communities.

The scheme, implemented through effective partnership working, will contribute to making York's roads safer by reducing traffic.

**Corporate Aim 5:** Work with others to improve the health, well-being and independence of York residents.

The scheme will improve air quality through a reduction in congestion.

**Local Transport Plan (LTP):** The scheme would contribute to several of the aims and objectives outlined in the Council's Local Transport Plan relating to a reduction in congestion and improvement to air quality and accessibility.

## Implications

### Financial

33. It is anticipated that the construction of the Haxby Station scheme will be funded by the DfT through the Local Transport Plan Major Scheme Bid process. Funding for all of the development costs prior to Programme Entry would have to come from local resources. To enable the successful delivery of the scheme, it is recommended that the Council provides a full time resource to manage implementation of the scheme along with partners in the rail industry. The anticipated cost for this resource is estimated at £56k and would be funded through the Capital Programme.
34. Network Rail's Option Selection Report estimated the cost of developing Option 2 to GRIP 4 as £237 307. Subject to confirmation, it is anticipated that Network Rail will fund a proportion of the GRIP 4 costs. The individual components are shown in Table 4.

Element	Cost
Bridges	£17 043
Infrastructure	£25 905
Environmental	£4 912
Geotechnical	£10 695
Mechanical and electrical	£25 055
Signalling	£53 641
Track works	£4 985



Survey	£7 570
Transport Planning	£1 040
Project management, planning and commercial support	£38 981
Network Rail costs	£28 488
Contingency	£18 992
Total	£237 307

35. It is anticipated that there will be a need to update the original business case and prepare a full Major Scheme Business Case to enable the scheme to be submitted to the DfT for Programme Entry status. An allowance of up to £50k would need to be made for the preparation of the economic appraisal documentation. It is projected that a total allocation of £250k would need to be made in the City Strategy Capital Programme to cover the preparatory costs up to the programme entry stage.

#### **Human Resources (HR)**

36. Should funding be made available it is anticipated that the Council will need to provide a full time resource to manage implementation of the scheme along with partners in the rail industry. The job will be a fixed term contract, reporting to the Head of Transport Planning, graded in the region of P06 for the duration of the project (18 months). The job will involve project management of the scheme and liaison with the rail industry at a senior level.

#### **Equalities**

37. There are no implications relating to Equalities for this scheme at the present time. Equalities issues will be dealt with during detailed scheme design.

#### **Legal**

38. There are no legal issues relating to this scheme at the present time. However, the Council may need to enter into further agreements with Network Rail to progress the project.

#### **Crime and Disorder**

39. There are no Crime and Order issues relating to this scheme at the present time.

#### **Information Technology (IT)**

40. There are no Information Technology issues relating to this scheme at the present time.

## Property

41. There are no property issues relating to this scheme at the present time.

## Other

42. There are no other issues relating to this scheme at the present time.

## Risk Management

43. There are considerable risks involved with successfully delivering the scheme. At this stage, the main risks relate to securing funding, the acquisition of land and obtaining planning consent. Later in the project there is a risk that cost overruns may have to be borne by the Council. Mitigation measures will be put in place to minimise the risks to the Council as the project progresses.

## Recommendations

44. That the Advisory Panel advise the Executive Member to note current progress in developing Haxby Rail Station.

45. It is recommended that the development of Option 2 of the Haxby Station scheme to Programme Entry Stage is put forward for consideration for inclusion within the 2009/10 Capital Programme.

**Reason:** The council has, in partnership with third parties, made significant progress toward developing a suitable scheme option for building a new rail station at Haxby, which has been included in the latest Regional Funding Advice programme to Government. However, further detailed design and assessment work is required to enable the scheme to attain Department for Transport (DfT) 'Scheme Entry' status, being one of the stages that need to be achieved in order to gain DfT funding for the project. It is envisaged that this design and assessment work can be substantially completed within the 2009/10 financial year, but capital funding needs to be secured in order to do this.

## Contact Details

<b>Author:</b>	<b>Chief Officer Responsible for the report:</b>		
<b>Ian Stokes</b> <b>Principal Transport Planner</b> <b>Transport Planning Unit</b> <b>01904 551429</b>	Damon Copperthwaite, Assistant Director City Development and Transport		
Paul Brand Transport Planner (Strategy) Transport Planning Unit 01904 551413	<b>Report Approved</b>	✓	<b>Date</b> <i>March 2009</i>
	Chief Officer's name Title		
	<b>Report Approved</b>	<i>tick</i>	<b>Date</b> <i>Insert Date</i>

**Specialist Implications Officer(s)** List information for all

Implication Financial  
Name Tony Clarke  
Title City Strategy Capital Programme Manager  
Tel No. 01904 551641

**Wards Affected:** Haxby & Wigginton, Strensall

All

**For further information please contact the author of the report**

**Background Papers:**

Report to Transport Scrutiny Board on 28<sup>th</sup> October 2002 - Delays in the provision of additional rail halts in the York area.

Report to Executive Member for Planning and Transport and Advisory Panel on 3<sup>rd</sup> September 2003 – Rail Update I

Report to Executive Member for Planning and Transport and Advisory Panel on 3<sup>rd</sup> December 2003 – Rail Update II

Report to Executive Member for Planning and Transport and Advisory Panel on 11 September 2006 – Rail Update III

**Annexes:**

Annex A – Fast Track Option 1 plan

Annex B – Fast Track Option 2 plan

Annex C – Light rail options for the York-Scarborough line.